From: <u>Jay Field</u>

To: <u>Eric Blischke/R10/USEPA/US@EPA</u>

Cc: Burt Shephard/R10/USEPA/US@EPA; Chip Humphrey/R10/USEPA/US@EPA; Jennifer L Peterson;

jeremy_buck@fws.gov; anderson.jim@deq.state.or.us; Joe Goulet/R10/USEPA/US@EPA; MCCLINCY Matt; POULSEN Mike; Robert.Neely@noaa.gov; csmith@parametrix.com; Robert Gensemer; sheila@ridolfi.com; Benjamin Shorr; Mary.Baker@noaa.gov; David.G.Farrer@state.or.us; dallen@stratusconsulting.com; jpeers@stratusconsulting.com; Bob Dexter; JMalek@parametrix.com; Nancy.Munn@noaa.gov;

Greg.Gervais@noaa.gov

Subject: Re: Fw: reference stations **Date:** 11/23/2008 02:48 PM

Attachments: PH Tox RefStations 081123.xls

```
Based on the list of reference stations in your email and the approach recommended by MacDonald and Landrum to determine toxicity thresholds (5th percentile of reference station responses), the attached file shows the stations toxicity results for the 4 test endpoints and the thresholds (as determined by Excel's percentile calculation). Are these
thresholds consistent with your intended approach?
Blischke.Eric@epamail.epa.gov wrote:
> Here is where we landed on the selection of reference stations for the
> benthic evaluation. We will be confirming that this meets our
> agreements. Let me know if you have any questions.
    Thanks, Eric ----- Forwarded by Eric Blischke/R10/USEPA/US on 11/14/2008 01:03 PM -----
                                          "Jennifer
                                         Woronets"
                                         < iworonets@ancho</pre>
                                                                                                            Eric Blischke/R10/USEPA/US@EPA,
                                         renv.com>
                                                                                                           Chip Humphrey/R10/USEPA/US@EPA
                                         11/14/2008 11:41
                                                                                                            <ANDERSON.Jim@deq.state.or.us>,
                                                                                                           audiehuber@ctuir.com>, Eric
Blischke/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, "Bob
Wyatt" <rjw@nwnatural.com>,
                                                                                                           wyatt" <rjwenwnatural.com>,
<unninghame@gorge.net>,
<erin.madden@gmail.com>, Chip
Humphrey/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, "JT
Williams " <jdw@jdw-law.net>,
"Jennifer Peers"
                                                                                                                                                                           Chip
                                                                                                            <jpeers@stratusconsulting.com>,
"Jennifer Woronets"
                                                                                                           "Jennier woronets"
<jworonets@anchorenv.com>, "Julie
Fox" <jfox@anchorenv.com>, "Julie
Weis" <jweis@hk-law.com>, "Keith
Pine" <kpine@anchorenv.com>,
Kristine Koch/R10/USEPA/US@EPA,
lisa.bluelake@grandronde.org>,
                                                                                                            "MCCLINCY Matt"
                                                                                                            <MCCLINCY.Matt@deq.state.or.us>,
                                                                                                            <MCCLINCY.Matt@deq.state.or.us>,
"McKenna, Jim"
<Jim.McKenna@portofportland.com>,
"Michael Karnosh"
<michael.karnosh@grandronde.org>,
"Dichael.alarnosh@grandronde.org>,
                                                                                                            "Rick Applegate"

<RICKA@BES.CI.PORTLAND.OR.US>,
"Robert Neely"

<
                                                                                                           <ri><ri><riy@nwnatural.com>,<david.ashton@portofportland.com>
                                                                                                           <aavid.asnton@portofportla
, <wolffg@plu.edu>, "J Bet
<jbetz@ci.portland.or.us>,
"Jennifer Woronets"
<jworonets@anchorenv.com>,
                                                                                                            <Jwn.tonetswanenorenv.com>,
<Jim.McKenna@portofportland.com>,
"Patty Dost \((Schwabe\))"
<Pdost@Schwabe.com>, "Rick
                                                                                                            Applegate"
<RICKA@BES.CI.PORTLAND.OR.US>,
                                                                                                            "Keith Pine"
                                                                                                            <kpine@anchorenv.com>, "Jennifer
                                                                                                           <jworonets@anchorenv.com>, "John
Toll" <johnt@windwardenv.com>
                                                                                                                                                                                 Subject
                                                                                                            FW: reference stations
```

```
> Please see below and attached revised criteria for identifying reference > stations and revised map of reference envelope stations.
> Thank you,
    Thank you,
Jen Woronets
Anchor Environmental, LLC
6650 SW Redwood Lane, Suite 333
Portland, OR 97224
503-670-1108 Phone Ext 24
503-670-1128 Fax
ü Please consider the environment before printing this email.
> From: John Toll [mailto:johnt@windwardenv.com]
> Sent: Friday, November 14, 2008 10:14 AM
> To: Bob Wyatt
> Cc: Jennifer Woronets; Keith Pine; Lisa Saban; Helle B. Andersen
     Subject: reference stations
     Bob - Attached please find the revised criteria for identifying
     reference stations, and the revised map of reference envelope stations. The selection criteria were revised based on requests made by Eric Blischke in a November 7, 2008 teleconference with Burt Shephard, Jim
     McKenna and me.
    We have applied the revised criteria to identify reference stations, and modified the reference envelope accordingly. The revised list of reference envelope stations is as follows:
                              |U3C-1 |
        G766
        G767
                               U3C-2
                               U3C-3
        G786a
        G788
                               |U4Q-1
        G788a
                               U4Q-2
        U1C-1
                               |U4Q-3
        U1C-2
                               | U50 - 1
        II2C - 1
                               U5Q-2
        TT2C - 3
                           | U5Q - 3
Three reference stations dropped out based on the revised screening > criteria. They are G786, U6TOC-1 and U6TOC-3. Two new stations > screened in. They are G786a and G788a.
> The LWG has made all of EPA's requested changes to the reference

> criteria, so this should be the final set of reference envelope

> stations. Once that is confirmed by EPA, the last outstanding issue for

> defining the benthic interpretive approach will have been resolved.

> Therefore, EPA should also be able to confirm that we are ready to

> proceed with the benthic BERA.
> John
    John Toll, Ph.D.
     Partner
      Windward Environmental LLC
    200 West Mercer Street, Suite 401
Seattle, WA 98119-3958
(206) 812-5433
(206) 913-3292 (cell)
     www.windwardenv.com
> The information contained in this e-mail message is intended only for > the personal and confidential use of the recipient named above. This > message may be an attorney-client communication and as such is privileged and confidential. If the reader of this message is not the > recipient named above or an agent responsible for delivering it to the > intended recipient, the reader is hereby notified that this message has > been received in error and that any review, dissemination, copying or > distribution of this message is strictly prohibited. If you have > received this message in error, please notify the sender immediately, > and delete this message.
> and delete this message:
> (See attached file: 3518_Bioassay locs meeting reference
> criteria_LSM_revised 111208.pdf)(See attached file: Final Memo Criteria
> for Identifying Reference Sediment Samples.pdf)
Jay Field
Assessment and Restoration Division
Office of Response and Restoration, NOAA
7600 Sand Point Way NE
Seattle, WA 98115-6349
(P) 206-526-6404
(F) 206-526-6865
(E) jay.field@noaa.gov
```